

V城·古都·後遺民？

——董啟章、朱天心1990年代「失城」書寫比較

林肇豐

成功大學台灣文學系博士

摘要

「失城」一詞原是香港作家黃碧雲的短篇小說名，後為學者引用來描述1990年代香港文學的主流傾向。在「失城文學」中，董啟章寫於九七前夕的〈永盛街興衰史〉、《地圖集》等，將現實和虛構融冶一爐，彷彿憂傷著城市的失去、批判權力宰制，卻又不願給予定義而時刻游離，使得作品頗具曖昧甚至虛無之意味。而幾乎同一時間，台灣作家朱天心也發表了受人注目的〈古都〉，透過偽觀光客的眼光重新審視台北，而感到這座自己出生成長的城市，如今竟變得恐怖陌生。小說背後自然有其承載的言外之意，就此角度而言，朱天心也失去了她的城市。

對於這樣的兩種書寫，王德威在〈千年華胥之夢〉中皆將之劃入「後遺民」文學的行列。

而本論文則透過比較董啟章的「V城系列」（及〈永盛街興衰史〉）與朱天心的《古都》（及《想我眷村的兄弟們》、《漫遊者》），指出兩者的「失城」書寫看似相似，但在主題表現、歷史意識和精神特質上實有關鍵性差異，並不適合皆以「後遺民」涵納之。

如此比較一方面凸顯王德威理論中「遺民」與「後遺民」的含混模糊；二方面也試圖展現台、港兩地的「城市」文學和「鄉土」概念，其實有著不同的脈絡意義。

關鍵詞：失城、V城、古都、後遺民、城市文學

V City and *The Old Capital* as “Post-Loyalist”?

A Comparison of “Losing the city” Novels by Dung Kai-cheung and Zhu Tianxin in the 1990s.

Lin Chao-Li

Ph.D.

Department of Taiwanese Literature

National Cheng Kung University

Abstract

“Losing the City” is the name of a short story by Wong Bik-wan that scholars have cited as defining a central theme in Hong Kong literature in the 1990s, hence “Losing the City Literature.” Dung Kai-cheung’s *The Rise and Fall of Wing Shing Street and Atlas: The Archaeology of an Imaginary City*, which he wrote on the eve of the handover in 1997, both mourn for the city Dung is going to lose and also offer a critique of political domination. But Dung’s critique is hardly explicit, as he eschews precise definitions and conventional narrative temporality. As a result, both of these works are hard to grasp and even nihilistic. Almost at the same time, the Taiwanese writer Zhu Tianxin published *The Old Capital*. In this novel, she reexamines Taipei from the point of view of a tourist who feels estranged from and afraid of the city she grew up in. Her novel, like Dung’s two works cited above, implies that Zhu Tianxin also feels she is losing her city.

David Der-wei Wang discussed both Dung’s and Zhu’s works in terms of “Post-Loyalist” literature in his *The Thousand Year Dream of the Well-Governed State of Huaxu* because both writers remain loyal to a city that they feel they are losing, with the disagreement about Wang’s diagnosis, this paper will argue that Dung and Zhu’s oeuvres are comparable but distinct.

By comparing Dung Kai-cheung’s *V City* (and *The Rise and Fall of Wing Shing Street*) with Zhu Tianxin’s *The Old Capital* (and *In Remembrance of My Buddies from the Military Compound* and *The Flâneur*), this study claims that while both Dung and Zhu

appear to feel they have lost their cities, there are nonetheless crucial differences in the expression of the subject matter, historical ideology and spiritual qualities that make the “Post-Loyalist” label questionable.

On the one hand this research underlines the ambiguity of “Loyalist” and “Post-Loyalist” in David Der-wei Wang’s theory, and on the other hand, it aims to demonstrate that the concepts of “city” literature and *hsiang-tu* in Hong Kong and Taiwan have different meanings in their respective contexts.

Keywords: Losing the City, *V City*, *The Old Capital*, Post-Loyalist, City Literature

